APPENDIX 14B

EXAMPLE APPLICATION OF APV TO AN INTRAMARGINAL INVESTOR

his Appendix picks up following section 14.3.6 in Chapter 14. To further refine your understanding of value additivity and the APV decision rule and to see their usefulness for intramarginal investment analysis, consider a pension fund. In the United States (as in many other countries), pension funds are effectively tax-exempt investors. (See the boxed feature *How Are Pension Fund Contributions Effectively Tax-Exempt?* on page 324 in Chapter 14.) This will normally make a pension fund an intramarginal investor in both the property and debt markets. So let us re-examine our levered investment in the \$1 million apartment property of Chapter 14, only now assuming that the investor is a pension fund. For illustrative purposes we will hold all else the same, including the proposed use of the 5.5 percent, \$750,000 loan.

How can the principle of value additivity help us to deepen our understanding of the pension fund's investment in the apartment property?¹ To see this, consider Exhibit 14B-1, which once again portrays the investor's "personalized" after-tax cash flows (in the tax-exempt pension fund's case, the same as its before-tax cash flows), together with separate evaluation of the property cash flows and the debt cash flows.

First, we determine the investment value to the pension fund of the property itself free and clear of debt. To do this, we discount the pension fund's "personalized" PATCFs (reflecting the fund's zero tax rate) at the market's unlevered (property level) after-tax OCC that we derived in section 14.3.6 in Chapter 14, from analysis of the marginal taxed investor in the property market. There (as summarized in Exhibit 14-6) we determined that the after-tax going-in IRR for unlevered investment in the apartment property was 4.76 percent. Assuming that the tax rates in Exhibit 14-3 (35 percent on ordinary income, 15 percent on capital gain, and 25 percent on depreciation recapture) typify the marginal investor in the market for such apartment property (and assuming that \$1 million is the market value of such property), 4.76 percent represents the market's after-tax OCC for the subject property.² This results in an IV of the property to the tax-exempt pension fund of \$1,104,714, considerably above the \$1 million MV of the property, reflecting the fund's tax advantage compared to marginal investors in the apartment market.

Similarly, we determine that the investment value to the pension fund of the future aftertax cash outflows on the loan is negative \$832,202. This is derived from discounting the loan's after-tax payments (for the P.F. the same as the before-tax debt service) at the market's after-tax OCC for the debt, based on a comparison of municipal bond yields versus corporate bond yields as described in section 14.3.6. Since the pension fund faces no income taxes, it obtains no tax shield from the interest expense on the loan, causing the loan interest payments to have a greater present value to the pension fund than to the marginal investor in the debt market, who is taxed (and therefore obtains value from the interest tax shield).

¹In mainstream corporate finance, the value additivity and APV principles are often derived using an arbitrage analysis which is in theory applicable only to market value. However, the fundamental principle of value additivity applied to cash flow components can also be applied to analyze investment value, taking care as always to apply appropriate market-based OCC discount rates to each personalized cash flow component.

 $^{^{2}}$ Recall our discussion in section 14.3.5 (and earlier in section 12.1 of Chapter 12) that the appropriate discount rate for IV valuation should usually come from the capital market. See in particular footnote 30 in section 14.3.5.

Image: constraint of the second set of the second second set of the second second set of the second second set of	(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (11) (12) (13) <th>(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (6) (7) (1) (1) (12) (13)</th> <th></th> <th>Apprec.Rate : Yield = Income Tax R Debt Mkt Mai</th> <th>= ate = rgl Tax Rate</th> <th>$\begin{array}{l} 1.00\% \\ 6.00\% \\ 0.00\% \\ = 25.00\% \end{array}$</th> <th></th> <th>Bldg.Val/Pro Depreciable CGTax Rate DepRecaptui</th> <th>p.Val = Life = = e Rate =</th> <th>80.00% 27.5 years 0.00% 0.00%</th> <th></th> <th>Loan = Int = Amort/yr</th> <th>\$750,000 5.50% \$2,000</th> <th>PV @</th> <th>6.44% = \$270</th> <th>,548</th>	(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (6) (7) (1) (1) (12) (13)		Apprec.Rate : Yield = Income Tax R Debt Mkt Mai	= ate = rgl Tax Rate	$\begin{array}{l} 1.00\% \\ 6.00\% \\ 0.00\% \\ = 25.00\% \end{array}$		Bldg.Val/Pro Depreciable CGTax Rate DepRecaptui	p.Val = Life = = e Rate =	80.00% 27.5 years 0.00% 0.00%		Loan = Int = Amort/yr	\$750,000 5.50% \$2,000	PV @	6.44% = \$270	,548
(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (6) (7) (1) (11) (12) (13) <th>(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (11) (12) (13)<th>(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (11) (12) (13)<th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th></th></th>	(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (11) (12) (13) <th>(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (11) (12) (13)<th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th></th>	(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (11) (12) (13) <th></th>														
at Prop.Val Noi C tax wout tax wout <thtax th="" wout<=""> tax wout tax wout</thtax>	at Prop.val Nol C tax would shift Loan Loan Dis Exr.c Loan (h-0) (10) (g)-(10) (g)-(1	at Prop.Nal Nol C tax wout top-01 C (-0,-0)		(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(9)	(2)	(8)	(6)	(10)	(11)	(12)	(13)
\$1,000,000 \$0,000,000 \$0,000,000 \$0,000,000 \$4,300,000 \$4,320,000 \$4,34,300 \$4,320,000 \$4,34,300	31,000,000 51,000,000 53,50,14,000 53,50,14,000 53,50,14,000 53,50,13,20,30 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,50,13,22,00 53,51,20,13,22,00 53,51,20,13,22,00 53,51,20,13,22,00 53,51,20,13,22,00 53,51,20,13,22,00 53,51,20,13,22,00 53,51,20,13,22,20,23,22,20,23,22,20,20,00 53,51,20,13,22,20,23,22,20,20,00 53,21,20,20,20,00 53,21,20,20,20,00,2,22,20,20,00 53,21,20,20,20,00,2,22,20,20,00 53,21,20,20,20,20,20,20,20,00 53,21,20,21,22,22,20,20,20,00 53,21,20,20,20,20,20,20,20,20,20,20,20,20,20,	51,000,000 51,000,000 51,000,000 51,000,000 51,000,000 51,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 52,000 <th>ar</th> <th>Prop.Val</th> <th>ION</th> <th>J</th> <th>PBTCF</th> <th>tax w/out shields</th> <th>DTS</th> <th>(4)-(5)+(6) PATCF</th> <th>LoanBal</th> <th>Loan DS</th> <th>ITS</th> <th>(4)–(9) EBTCF</th> <th>(7)-(9)+(10) EATCF</th> <th>(9)—(10) LoanATCFs</th>	ar	Prop.Val	ION	J	PBTCF	tax w/out shields	DTS	(4)-(5)+(6) PATCF	LoanBal	Loan DS	ITS	(4)–(9) EBTCF	(7)-(9)+(10) EATCF	(9)—(10) LoanATCFs
31,010,000 560,000 50 50 50 500,000 543,250 516,750 516,750 516,750 543,250 31,020,000 560,600 50 50 50 500 540,600 543,250 517,460 543,140 513,183 543,030 543,230 511,206 543,030 543,140 50 50,500 543,130 543,120 543,130 543,120 543,130 510,4466 543,130 510,	\$1,010,000 \$60,000 \$60,000 \$60,000 \$73,250 \$76,750 \$16,750 \$16,750 \$43,140 \$71,760 \$43,140 \$71,760 \$43,140 \$71,760 \$17,760 \$43,140 \$71,760 \$17,760 \$43,140 \$71,760 \$17,760 \$43,140 \$71,760 \$17,760 \$17,760 \$17,760 \$17,760 \$17,760 \$17,760 \$17,760 \$17,760 \$17,760 \$17,760 \$17,760 \$17,900 \$10,900 \$51,889 \$10,900 \$10,900 \$51,889 \$10,900 <td>1,010,000 560,000 50 560,000 5748,000 543,250 56,570 543,250 543,240 516,750 543,250 1,00,000 560,000 561,006 50 560,000 543,140 50 511,250 543,230 1,00,001 561,266 50 561,266 50 561,266 5746,000 543,340 50 511,266 543,230 536,64 71,40% 54</td> <td></td> <td>\$1,000,000</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>(\$1,000,000)</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>(\$1,104,714)</td> <td>\$750,000</td> <td>(\$750,000)</td> <td></td> <td>(\$250,000)</td> <td>(\$270,548)</td> <td>(\$832,202)</td>	1,010,000 560,000 50 560,000 5748,000 543,250 56,570 543,250 543,240 516,750 543,250 1,00,000 560,000 561,006 50 560,000 543,140 50 511,250 543,230 1,00,001 561,266 50 561,266 50 561,266 5746,000 543,340 50 511,266 543,230 536,64 71,40% 54		\$1,000,000			(\$1,000,000)			(\$1,104,714)	\$750,000	(\$750,000)		(\$250,000)	(\$270,548)	(\$832,202)
\$1,020,100 \$50,600 \$30 \$60,600 \$74,000 \$43,140 \$0 \$17,460 \$17,460 \$43,140 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$44,200 \$44	51,020,100 560,600 50 50,600 5746,000 531,400 531,400 531,400 531,400 531,400 531,400 531,400 531,400 531,400 531,400 531,400 531,400 531,320 542,300 531,320 542,300 543,100 543,300 532,300 543,300 532,300 543,300 543,300 532,300 543,300 543,300 543,300 543,300 543,300 543,300 543,300 543,300 543,300 543,300 543,300 510,300 572,300 520,300	\$1,020,100 \$60,600 \$0 \$60,600 \$71,460 \$43,140 \$0 \$17,460 \$43,140 \$1,020,100 \$50,600 \$51,206 \$50,600 \$51,206 \$51,206 \$51,206 \$53,200 \$1,020,100 \$52,436 \$0 \$51,1206 \$50,600 \$51,200 \$51,206 \$53,203 \$50 \$53,956 \$52,436 \$50,500 \$51,206 \$52,306 \$52,436 \$50,500 \$52,436 \$50,500 \$52,436 \$50,500 \$51,500 \$52,436 \$50,501 \$52,336 \$54,971 \$52,560 \$52,336 \$54,971 \$52,560 \$52,356 \$52,356 \$52,356 \$52,356 \$52,356 \$52,326 \$52,326 \$52,326 \$52,326 \$52,356 \$52,356 \$52,560 \$52,560 \$52,560 \$52,566 \$52,566 \$52,566 \$52,566		\$1,010,000	\$60,000	\$0	\$60,000	\$0	\$0	\$60,000	\$748,000	\$43,250	\$0	\$16,750	\$16,750	\$43,250
\$1,030,301\$61,206\$50,500\$11,206\$0\$51,824\$(331,824)\$31,824)\$343,030\$1,030,604\$52,436\$50,131\$0\$51,818\$742,000\$42,810\$54,920\$50\$19,626\$42,800\$42,800\$1,051,510\$53,061\$0\$53,061\$0\$50,300\$41,328\$744,000\$42,810\$50,506\$42,800\$42,700\$1,051,510\$53,061\$0\$53,061\$0\$53,061\$30\$51,010\$21,920\$50\$19,626\$42,700\$1,051,510\$53,061\$0\$53,061\$0\$53,061\$30\$51,010\$42,800\$42,700\$42,800\$1,061,520\$56,431\$50\$51,611\$20\$51,010\$42,700\$42,480\$64,497\$42,500\$1,04,622\$56,621\$0\$1,770,243\$730,000\$42,700\$42,700\$52,561\$42,500\$1,04,622\$56,621\$0\$50\$51,101,70,243\$730,000\$42,700\$52,560\$42,480\$1,04,622\$56,621\$0\$1,770,243\$730,000\$42,700\$52,560\$42,480\$1,04,622\$56,621\$50,000\$41,766\$51,104,714\$537,200\$42,370\$1,04,622\$56,621\$50\$64,971\$732,000\$42,480\$64,496\$43,56\$1,04,622\$56,621\$50\$64,971\$732,000\$42,480\$64,496\$43,56\$1,04,622\$56,210\$64,971\$732,000\$41,460\$72,200\$72,260 <td< td=""><td>51,030,301 561,206 550,000 511,206 50 50 50 51,1206 543,030 511,824 543,030 51,040,664 561,818 50 50 50 50 50 50 51,826 574,000 542,320 50 519,626 542,303 519,626 542,303 53,061 50,361 574,200 542,300 542,426 51,010 552,615 542,200 542,101 521,101 521,101 521,101 521,101 521,101 521,101 521,500 542,303 542,303 542,300 542,480 50,460 542,60 50,460 <td< td=""><td>\$1,030,301 \$61,206 \$50,000 \$11,206 \$744,000 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$42,020 \$43,030 \$42,000 \$43,030 \$42,000<!--</td--><td></td><td>\$1,020,100</td><td>\$60,600</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$60,600</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$60,600</td><td>\$746,000</td><td>\$43,140</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$17,460</td><td>\$17,460</td><td>\$43,140</td></td></td<></td></td<>	51,030,301 561,206 550,000 511,206 50 50 50 51,1206 543,030 511,824 543,030 51,040,664 561,818 50 50 50 50 50 50 51,826 574,000 542,320 50 519,626 542,303 519,626 542,303 53,061 50,361 574,200 542,300 542,426 51,010 552,615 542,200 542,101 521,101 521,101 521,101 521,101 521,101 521,101 521,500 542,303 542,303 542,300 542,480 50,460 542,60 50,460 <td< td=""><td>\$1,030,301 \$61,206 \$50,000 \$11,206 \$744,000 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$42,020 \$43,030 \$42,000 \$43,030 \$42,000<!--</td--><td></td><td>\$1,020,100</td><td>\$60,600</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$60,600</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$60,600</td><td>\$746,000</td><td>\$43,140</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$17,460</td><td>\$17,460</td><td>\$43,140</td></td></td<>	\$1,030,301 \$61,206 \$50,000 \$11,206 \$744,000 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$43,030 \$42,020 \$43,030 \$42,000 \$43,030 \$42,000 </td <td></td> <td>\$1,020,100</td> <td>\$60,600</td> <td>\$0</td> <td>\$60,600</td> <td>\$0</td> <td>\$0</td> <td>\$60,600</td> <td>\$746,000</td> <td>\$43,140</td> <td>\$0</td> <td>\$17,460</td> <td>\$17,460</td> <td>\$43,140</td>		\$1,020,100	\$60,600	\$0	\$60,600	\$0	\$0	\$60,600	\$746,000	\$43,140	\$0	\$17,460	\$17,460	\$43,140
\$1,040,604\$61,818\$0\$61,818\$742,000\$42,920\$0\$18,898\$19,525\$1,051,010\$62,345\$0\$52,436\$740,000\$42,810\$0\$19,556\$19,556\$19,556\$42,700\$1,061,520\$63,601\$0\$63,601\$736,000\$42,810\$0\$20,361\$24,700\$1,072,135\$64,321\$0\$63,601\$734,000\$42,590\$0\$21,101\$24,790\$1,022,135\$64,971\$0\$0\$14,328\$734,000\$42,370\$0\$21,101\$42,590\$1,082,685\$54,971\$0\$64,971\$0\$14,328\$734,000\$42,370\$0\$22,610\$24,390\$1,082,685\$64,971\$0\$0\$14,328\$730,000\$42,370\$0\$22,601\$42,390\$1,046,622\$65,621\$0\$11,70,243\$730,000\$772,560\$0\$239,983\$772,260\$1,04,622\$65,621\$0\$1,170,243\$730,000\$772,560\$0\$397,983\$772,260\$1,04,622\$65,621\$0\$1,170,243\$730,000\$772,560\$0\$397,983\$772,260\$1,04,622\$65,621\$0\$64,771\$700,243\$730,000\$772,560\$0\$237,610\$1,04,714\$6\$4,76%\$1,704,714\$832,202\$532,202\$532,202\$232,612\$433%\$1,04,714\$6\$4,76%\$1,04,714\$832,202\$5232,212<	\$1,040,604 \$61,818 \$20 \$61,818 \$74,200 \$42,320 \$6 \$18,898 \$18,898 \$18,898 \$18,398 \$18,398 \$18,398 \$12,920 \$19,656 \$19,656 \$19,656 \$12,320 \$10,51,010 \$52,436 \$19,650 \$12,656 \$12,4200 \$14,328 \$14,348	51,040,664 561,818 50 561,818 50 561,818 5742,000 542,920 50 519,655 542,800 542,500 542,800 542,500 542,800 542,500 542,800 542,500 5		\$1,030,301	\$61,206	\$50,000	\$11,206	\$0	\$0	\$11,206	\$744,000	\$43,030	\$0	(\$31,824)	(\$31,824)	\$43,030
\$1,051,010\$62,436\$0\$62,436\$740,000\$42,810\$0\$19,626\$42,810\$1,061,520\$63,601\$0\$63,601\$0\$63,601\$738,000\$42,700\$0\$21,700\$21,700\$1,072,135\$63,601\$0\$63,691\$738,000\$42,590\$72,500\$21,101\$21,101\$42,590\$1,072,135\$64,971\$0\$14,328\$734,000\$42,590\$64,371\$21,101\$42,590\$1,035,857\$64,971\$0\$14,328\$734,000\$42,480\$0\$21,101\$42,370\$1,045,6581\$56,971\$0\$11,70,243\$732,000\$72,200\$72,2601\$22,661\$22,370\$1,046,6582\$64,971\$0\$17,02,43\$732,000\$72,200\$72,260\$0\$24,480\$1,046,6582\$66,971\$0\$17,70,243\$732,000\$72,260\$0\$23,661\$23,370\$1,046,6582\$6\$1,702,43\$732,000\$772,260\$0\$52,501\$52,501\$52,320\$6,047\$0\$6,471\$730,000\$772,260\$0\$52,501\$52,320\$6,047\$0\$1,702,43\$730,000\$772,260\$0\$52,501\$52,501\$6,047\$0\$1,04,714\$53,002\$72,502\$52,026\$0\$52,501\$52,202\$6,047\$0\$1,04,714\$832,202\$72,502\$52,05,61\$53,2,02\$52,202\$6,047\$6,4474\$6,4474\$6,4744\$6,4746\$6,476	\$1,051,010 \$62,436 \$0 \$62,436 \$740,000 \$42,810 \$0 \$19,626 \$42810 \$1,051,010 \$63,661 \$0 \$63,661 \$738,000 \$42,700 \$61,911 \$20,361 \$21,001 \$42,590 \$1,021,015 \$56,661 \$0 \$63,661 \$738,000 \$42,700 \$61,911 \$21,101 \$42,590 \$1,082,857 \$64,921 \$0 \$14,328 \$734,000 \$42,300 \$42,310 \$20,361 \$21,101 \$42,590 \$1,082,857 \$64,921 \$50 \$61,971 \$53,000 \$42,370 \$50 \$23,400 \$21,101 \$42,590 \$20,361 \$22,370 \$1,082,857 \$64,971 \$50 \$0 \$1,10,243 \$50 \$51,101 \$51,500 \$42,370 \$20,560 \$41,986 \$42,480 \$20,561 \$22,500 \$1,04,622 \$65,621 \$50 \$0 \$1,10,243 \$73,000 \$42,370 \$50,960 \$41,386 \$42,480 \$72,560 \$74,080 \$52,601 \$20,581 \$52,502 \$74,086 \$41,986 \$42,370 \$72,560 \$11,476	\$1,051,010 \$62,436 \$50 \$60 \$52,436 \$74,000 \$42,810 \$0 \$19,626 \$42,810 \$20,361 \$21,010 \$21,700 \$21,700 \$21,700 \$21,700 \$21,700 \$21,700 \$21,700 \$21,700 \$21,700 \$21,701 \$24,590 \$21,700 \$22,931 \$22,361 \$24,700 \$21,700 \$21,701 \$24,590 \$21,701 \$24,590 \$21,701 \$24,590 \$21,701 \$24,590 \$21,701 \$24,590 \$21,701 \$24,590 \$24,340		\$1,040,604	\$61,818	\$0	\$61,818	\$0	\$0	\$61,818	\$742,000	\$42,920	\$0	\$18,898	\$18,898	\$42,920
\$1,061,520\$63,061\$0\$63,061\$0\$63,061\$1,20,361\$21,101\$21,101\$21,101\$21,300\$1,032,855\$64,971\$0\$1,170,243\$0\$0\$1,170,243\$73,000\$42,370\$0\$22,601\$22,601\$42,370\$1,04,622\$65,621\$0\$0\$1,170,243\$73,000\$712,260\$0\$53,732\$37,260\$41,36\$1,104,622\$65,621\$0\$0\$1,170,243\$73,000\$712,260\$0\$53,993\$3712,260\$1,104,622\$65,621\$0\$0\$1,170,243\$730,000\$712,260\$0\$53,993\$372,260\$1,04,114\$71,04,622\$6,4971\$6,04%\$1,104,114\$5,50%\$74,000\$64,466\$4,13%\$64,476\$4,13%\$1,004,014\$6,046\$6,176%\$1,04,714\$532,202\$61,104,714\$532,202\$523,202\$61,486\$64,466\$4,13%\$1,004,114\$6,047,114\$6,047,114\$6,047,114\$6,223,202\$22,02,512\$22,02,518\$61,104,714\$6,44%\$4,13%\$1,004,114\$6,046,014\$1,004,714\$52,02,512\$22,02,512\$22,02,518\$60,106,106,106	\$1,061,520 \$63,061 \$0 \$63,061 \$0 \$50,061 \$20,361 \$20,361 \$20,361 \$20,361 \$42,700 \$50,361 \$20,361 \$42,700 \$51,011 \$51,011 \$52,590 \$51,011 \$51,5101 \$52,560 \$51,611 \$51,701 \$54,590 \$51,011 \$51,701 \$54,590 \$51,011 \$51,701 \$54,590 \$51,011 \$51,701 \$52,560 \$51,101 \$52,560 \$52,501 \$52,503 \$52,561 \$52,503 \$52,561 \$52,560 \$52,72,560 \$52,72,560 \$52,72,560 \$52,72,560 \$52,72,560 \$52,72,560 \$52,72,560 \$52,72,560 \$52,72,560 \$52,72,560 \$52,72,560 </td <td>31,061,520 \$63,061 \$0 \$63,061 \$0 \$63,061 \$1,328,000 \$42,700 \$0 \$20,361 \$20,361 \$24,250 \$1,071,135 \$63,691 \$0 \$63,691 \$738,000 \$42,590 \$0 \$21,101 \$21,101 \$21,101 \$21,501 \$24,250 \$24,280 \$20,361 \$24,280 \$24,280 \$20,361 \$24,280 \$24,280 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,501 \$24,230 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,501 \$24,372 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$21,001 \$21,701 \$21,301 \$22,501 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$25,601 \$20,361 \$24,370<!--</td--><td></td><td>\$1,051,010</td><td>\$62,436</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$62,436</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$62,436</td><td>\$740,000</td><td>\$42,810</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$19,626</td><td>\$19,626</td><td>\$42 810</td></td>	31,061,520 \$63,061 \$0 \$63,061 \$0 \$63,061 \$1,328,000 \$42,700 \$0 \$20,361 \$20,361 \$24,250 \$1,071,135 \$63,691 \$0 \$63,691 \$738,000 \$42,590 \$0 \$21,101 \$21,101 \$21,101 \$21,501 \$24,250 \$24,280 \$20,361 \$24,280 \$24,280 \$20,361 \$24,280 \$24,280 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,501 \$24,230 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,501 \$24,372 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$21,001 \$21,701 \$21,301 \$22,501 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$24,370 \$25,601 \$20,361 \$24,370 </td <td></td> <td>\$1,051,010</td> <td>\$62,436</td> <td>\$0</td> <td>\$62,436</td> <td>\$0</td> <td>\$0</td> <td>\$62,436</td> <td>\$740,000</td> <td>\$42,810</td> <td>\$0</td> <td>\$19,626</td> <td>\$19,626</td> <td>\$42 810</td>		\$1,051,010	\$62,436	\$0	\$62,436	\$0	\$0	\$62,436	\$740,000	\$42,810	\$0	\$19,626	\$19,626	\$42 810
\$1,072,135\$63,691\$0\$63,691\$0\$63,691\$736,000\$42,590\$0\$21,101\$21,101\$21,101\$22,600\$1,082,857\$64,971\$0\$14,328\$0\$734,000\$42,480\$0\$23,152)\$22,601\$42,480\$1,093,685\$64,971\$0\$1,702,43\$0\$1,702,43\$732,000\$42,370\$0\$22,601\$22,601\$42,480\$1,104,622\$66,621\$0\$1,702,43\$0\$1,702,243\$730,000\$47,370\$6,4497\$6,4496\$4,136of above CF Stream = 6.04% 4.76% 5.50% $730,000$ \$772,260\$0\$42,360\$47,36of above CF Stream = 6.04% 4.76% $7.106,62$ 5.50% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream = 6.04% $7.104,714$ $872,500$ $570,506$ $50,903$ $532,201$ $522,601$ $522,601$ $522,601$ of above CF Stream = 6.04% 4.76% 7.70% 5.50% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream = 6.04% $7.104,714$ 7.00% 5.70% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream = $7.104,714$ 7.00% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream = 7.40% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream =<	\$1,072,135 \$63,691 \$0 \$63,691 \$736,000 \$42,590 \$0 \$21,101 \$21,101 \$42,590 \$1,032,857 \$64,971 \$0 \$14,328 \$734,000 \$42,480 \$0 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$42,480 \$41,328 \$1,033,685 \$64,971 \$0 \$1,170,243 \$732,000 \$42,480 \$0 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$41,38 \$1,104,622 \$65,621 \$0 \$0 \$1,170,243 \$730,000 \$47,250 \$0 \$32,601 \$41,36 \$41,36 of above CF Stream = 6.04% \$0 \$1,102,43 \$730,000 \$772,260 \$0 \$327,903 \$5172,260 \$41,36 \$41,36 of above CF Stream = 6.04% \$0 \$1,00,174 \$732,000 \$772,260 \$0 \$327,093 \$3772,260 \$41,36 \$41,36 of above CF Stream = 6.04% \$1,100,174 \$732,000 \$772,260 \$0 \$740% \$413% \$772,260 \$61 \$740% \$740% \$740% \$740% \$740% \$740% \$740% \$740% \$740%	31,072,135 563,691 50 50 50 50 53,691 573,600 542,590 50 521,101 51,101 51,101 51,101 542,590 51,082,857 564,971 50 50 50 51,320 534,900 522,600 522,601 522,601 522,601 522,601 522,500 522,601 522,501 522,501 522,501 522,500 522,500 523,793 5397,983 5772,260 523,703 5397,983 5772,260 523,703 5397,983 5772,260 523,703 5397,983 5772,260 523,703 5397,983 5772,260 523,703 5397,983 5772,260 5397,983 5772,260 5772,560 50,44% 4,13% 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 50,44% 4,13% 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,560 5772,513 5772,512 5772,512 5772,512 5270,548* 1104,714 5832,202 5272,512 5270,548* 1104,714 5832,202 5272,512		\$1,061,520	\$63,061	\$0	\$63,061	\$0	\$0	\$63,061	\$738,000	\$42,700	\$0	\$20,361	\$20,361	\$42,700
51,082,857 564,328 550,000 514,328 50 50 54,971 50 54,370 50 52,601 522,601 522,601 522,601 522,601 54,370 54,370 50 51,100,368 51,100,368 564,971 50 564,971 50 564,971 573,000 573,200 50 50,093 522,601 522,601 522,601 522,601 542,370 542,370 50 5172,260 542,370 50 50 542,370 50 50 542,370 542,370 522,601 522,601 542,370 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,480 542,440 542,480 542,4	\$1,082,857 \$64,971 \$50,000 \$14,328 \$73,000 \$42,480 \$0 \$22,601 \$22,601 \$42,480 \$1,100,4622 \$66,971 \$0 \$1,170,243 \$0 \$1,170,243 \$732,000 \$42,480 \$0 \$52,601 \$22,601 \$42,430 \$1,100,4622 \$66,971 \$0 \$1,170,243 \$0 \$1,170,243 \$572,000 \$572,601 \$22,601 \$42,370 \$22,601 \$42,370 \$22,601 \$42,370 \$22,601 \$42,3250 \$772,260 \$41,360	51,082,857 564,328 550,000 514,328 5734,000 542,480 50 (328,152) (328,152) (328,152) 542,480 51,104,622 564,971 50 51,170,243 5730,000 5732,000 542,370 50 522,601 522,601 522,501 522,501 522,501 523,703 522,501 523,703 522,501 523,703 522,501 523,703 522,501 523,703 522,501 523,501 542,480 52,509 51,702,601 542,370 522,501 522,501 523,703 522,501 523,703 522,501 523,703 522,501 523,703 523,702 523,702 523,702 523,702 523,202 523,202 523,202 523,202 523,202 523,202 523,202 523,202 532,202 532,202 532,202 532,202 532,202 5832,202		\$1,072,135	\$63,691	\$0	\$63,691	\$0	\$0	\$63,691	\$736,000	\$42,590	\$0	\$21,101	\$21,101	\$42,590
51,093,685 564,971 50 50 50 54,971 50 54,370 50 52,601 52,501 54,2370 54,2370 50 5397,983 5772,260 54,377 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 51,104,622 51,104,622 55,621 50,00 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 50 5436,01 572,260 50 50 5436,01 572,260 5713,60 5714,60 <td< td=""><td>51,033,685 564,971 50 50,437,300 542,370 50 522,601 522,601 542,370 542,370 50 522,601 522,601 542,370 542,370 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 51,100,162 51,100,162 50 51,100,162 50 51,100,162 50 51,100,162 50 50,06 51,100,16 50 50% 5,50% 7,40% 6,44% 4,13% of above CF Stream = 6.04% 6.14,714 51,04,714 5,50% 7,40% 6,44% 4,13% PV @ 4.13% 51,104,714 52,202 51,104,714 5,50% 0 8,13% 5,32,202 Inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise. 1</td><td></td><td></td><td>\$1,082,857</td><td>\$64,328</td><td>\$50,000</td><td>\$14,328</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$0</td><td>\$14,328</td><td>\$734,000</td><td>\$42,480</td><td>\$0</td><td>(\$28,152)</td><td>(\$28,152)</td><td>\$42,480</td></td<>	51,033,685 564,971 50 50,437,300 542,370 50 522,601 522,601 542,370 542,370 50 522,601 522,601 542,370 542,370 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 5397,983 5772,260 50 51,100,162 51,100,162 50 51,100,162 50 51,100,162 50 51,100,162 50 50,06 51,100,16 50 50% 5,50% 7,40% 6,44% 4,13% of above CF Stream = 6.04% 6.14,714 51,04,714 5,50% 7,40% 6,44% 4,13% PV @ 4.13% 51,104,714 52,202 51,104,714 5,50% 0 8,13% 5,32,202 Inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise. 1			\$1,082,857	\$64,328	\$50,000	\$14,328	\$0	\$0	\$14,328	\$734,000	\$42,480	\$0	(\$28,152)	(\$28,152)	\$42,480
51,104,622 \$65,621 \$0 \$1,170,243 \$730,000 \$772,260 \$0 \$397,983 \$397,983 \$772,260 of above CF Stream = 6.04% 4.76% 4.76% 5.50% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream = 6.04% 6.14% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream = 6.04% 6.14% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream = 6.04% 6.144 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream = 6.04% 6.144 $7.104,714$ $8.232,202$ $8.32,202$ $8.32,202$ functione the case of equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise. 6.44% $8.72,212 \approx $270,548*$	51,104,622 \$65,621 \$0 \$1,170,243 \$730,000 \$772,260 \$0 \$397,983 \$772,260 of above CF Stream = 6.04% 4.76% 5.50% 5.50% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream = 6.04% $7.104,714$ 5.50% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% PV @ 4.76% $51,104,714$ $V = D = E$ $V - D = E$	[51,104,622] \$60 \$1,102,433 \$730,000 \$772,260 \$0 \$397,983 \$397,983 \$772,260 of above CF Stream = 6.04% 4.76% 5.50% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% of above CF Stream = 6.04% $81,104,714$ 7.50% 5.50% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% PV @ 4.13% $81,104,714$ V V B P B 4.13% Inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise. 4.13% 4.13% 4.13% 4.13% 4.13% 4.13% $5.332,202$ $5.327,512 \approx 5.270,548*$ 4.13% 4.13% $5.332,202$ Inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise. $148-1$ 1.13%		\$1,093,685	\$64,971	\$0	\$64,971	\$0	\$0	\$64,971	\$732,000	\$42,370	\$0	\$22,601	\$22,601	\$42,370
of above CF Stream = 6.04% 6.44% 4.13% 5.50% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% 4.13%	of above CF Stream = 6.04% 6.44% 4.13% 6.44% 4.13% 5.50% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% 5.104 , 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% $5.322.202$ PV @ 4.13% = 5832,202 PV @ 4.13\% = 5832,202 PV @ 4.13\% = 5832,202 PV @ 4.13\% = 5832,202 FV @ 4.13\% = 51,104,714 - 5832,202 FV @ 7,104 - 5837,205 FV @ 7,104 - 5837,205 FV @ 7,104 - 5837,205 FV @ 7,104 - 5837,205 = 5277,517 = 577,517 = 577,517 = 577,517 = 577,517 = 57	of above CF Stream = 6.04% 7.40% 6.44% 4.13% PV @ 4.76% = $51,104,714$ PV @ 4.13% = $5832,202$ inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.		\$1,104,622	\$65,621	\$0	\$1,170,243	\$0	\$0	\$1,170,243	\$730,000	\$772,260	\$0	\$397,983	\$397,983	\$772,260
PV @ 4.76% = \$1,104,714 $PV @ 4.13% = $832,202$ $PV @ 4.13% = $832,202$ $V - D = E$ $V - D = E$ $PV @ 4.13% = $832,202$ $PV @ 4.13% = $100,000$ PV	PV @ 4.76% = \$1,104,714 $PV @ 4.13% = $832,202$ inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	PV @ 4.76% = 51,104,714 $PV @ 4.13% = 5832,202$ $PV @ 4.13% = 5832,202$ $PV @ 4.13% = 5832,202$ inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise. $148-1$ + Value by Commonant Additivity for Intramacrinal Tax-events Invector. Fourity Value Fornals Property Value Minits, Debt Value $148-1$	of	above CF Strear	u =		6.04%		×	4.76%		5.50%		7.40%	6.44%	4.13%
$PV @ 4.76\% = \$1,104,714$ $PV @ 4.13\% = \$32,202$ $PV @ 4.13\% = \$32,202$ $PV = B = P$ $PV = 1104,714 - \$32,202 = \$272,512 \approx \$270,548*$ $PV = 1104,714 - \$322,202 = \$272,512 \approx \$270,548*$ inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	PV @ 4.76% = \$1,104,714 $PV @ 4.13% = $32,202$ inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	PV @ 4.76% = \$1,104,714 $PV @ 4.13% = $832,202$ $PV @ 4.13% = $10,000$ $PV @ 4.13% = $10,0000$ $PV @ 4.13% = $10,00000$ $PV @ 4.13% = $10,00000$ $PV @ 4.13% = $10,00000$ $PV @$														
$PV @ 4.76\% = $1,104,714$ $PV @ 4.13\% = $832,202$ $V - D = E$ $V - D = E$ $PV(equity) = $1,104,714 - $832,202 = $272,512 \approx $270,548*$ inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	PV @ 4.76% = \$1,104,714 $PV @ 4.13% = $832,202$ $PV @ 4.13% = $832,202$ inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	PV @ 4.76% = \$1,104,714 PV @ 4.13% = \$832,202 PV = $V - D = E$ inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise. 14B-1					L			Г						
Value Additivity: $V - D = E$ $V - D = E$ $IV(equity) = $1,104,714 - $832,202 = $272,512 \approx $270,548*$ Invinciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	Value Additivity: V - D = E V - D = E IV(equity) = \$1,104,714 - \$832,202 = \$272,512 ≈ \$270,548* In the exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	V - D = E V - D = E IV(equity) = \$1,104,714 - \$832,202 = \$272,512 \approx \$270,548* IV/equity) = \$1,104,714 - \$832,202 = \$272,512 \approx \$270,548* 14B-1 14B-1					P	/ @ 4.76% =	\$1,104,71	4				PV @ 4	.13% = \$832,2	02
V - D = E V - D = E $V - 5832,202 = $272,512 \approx $270,548*$ $V - 5832,202 = $272,512 \approx 5270,548*$ V - 5832,202 = 500,548* V - 5	V - D = E inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	rinciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise. 14B-1 14B-1 14B-1					L			/alue Additivit	Ä					
IV(equity) = \$1,104,714 - \$832,202 = \$272,512 ≈ \$270,548* wrinciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	IV(equity) = \$1,104,714 - \$832,202 = \$272,512 ≈ \$270,548* sinciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	IV(equity) = \$1,104,714 - \$832,202 = \$272,512 \$ \$270,548*] Inciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise. 14B-1								V - D = E						
vrinciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	orinciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise.	vinciple this equation should be exactly equal, otherwise there is some sort of "arbitrage" opportunity between the markets. But in reality valuations are not that precise. 14B-1 14 Value by Commonent Additivity for Intramarcinal Tax-exempt Invector: Fourity Value Fourals Prometry Value Minus Debt Value					<	V(equity) = \$	31,104,714	- \$832,202 =	= \$272,512 :	≈ \$270,548*				
		14B-1 tt Value hv Comonoert Additivity for Intramarcinal Tax-exempt Invector: Equity Value Equals Pronerty Value Minus Debt Value	Drinc	ciple this equation	on should b	e exactly equ	ial, otherwise th	nere is some so	ort of "arbitr	age" opportunity	/ between the	markets. But ir	reality valua	ations are not	that precise.	

Copyright @ 2021 Mbition LLC. All rights reserved. May not be scanned, copied or duplicated, or posted to a publicly accessible website, in whole or in part.

Invoking the value additivity principle, the pension fund's levered equity position in the investment consists of the property value minus the loan value: 1, 104, 714 - 832, 202 = 272, 512. This gives us some additional insight.

Applying the APV procedure, and assuming we could buy the property for its estimated market value of \$1,000,000, we see that the deal for the pension fund consists of a positive-NPV component combined with a negative NPV component:

 $\begin{aligned} APV &= NPV(Property) + NPV(Financing) \\ APV &= (\$1,104,714 - \$1,000,000) + (\$750,000 - \$832,202) \\ APV &= 104,714 + (-\$82,202) = \$22,512 \end{aligned}$

Purchasing the property without any debt brings the pension fund a positive NPV of \$104,714, while borrowing \$750,000 causes the pension fund a negative NPV of \$82,202. We see through the APV analysis of this intramarginal investor that it would make more sense for the pension fund to buy the property without using debt. This should not be surprising after our analysis in section 14.3.5 of the value of debt financing for investors that face different tax rates. The pension fund clearly faces a tax rate lower than that of the marginal investor in the debt market, and so faces a positive NPV from debt investment, hence a negative NPV from "negative investment" in debt, that is, borrowing.³

Finally, let's step back and see what this analysis tells the pension fund. First, it suggests that if they make the apartment investment without using debt, they could pay up to just over \$1.1 million for the property and the investment would still be positive NPV from their investment value perspective. If they use 75 percent debt of the terms in our example, they can only pay up to about \$1.02 million and still achieve positive investment value NPV. Of course, the pension fund should not have to pay more than the market value of \$1 million for the apartment property, so what this really tells them is that they can make a positive NPV of about \$100,000 if they don't use debt financing, or only about \$20,000 if they use the 75 percent LTV loan. The leverage would allow them to buy four equivalent properties instead of just one, so for the same \$1,000,000 of investable capital, the leveraged approach would produce a positive NPV of over \$80,000, which is probably not significantly less than the nonleveraged approach. Of course, the leveraged approach will involve more risk, including more volatility in the return, as they move along the risk/return trade-off frontier we discussed in Chapter 13. The pension fund will need to weigh these countervailing considerations from a strategic and tactical investment policy perspective to decide what they want to do.

³In the real world, this conclusion is tempered by the fact that the pension fund is capital constrained. The pension fund cannot issue new equity like a taxed corporation could. Its available funds are exogenously fixed. The availability of tax-sheltered investment capital is effectively constrained by the government's tax laws governing retirement savings and investments.